

# Harmony in virtual space: Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) development communication in creating digital literacy based on religious moderation

Humaizi<sup>1,\*</sup>, Nik Norma Nik Hasan<sup>2</sup>, Maulana Andinata Dalimunthe<sup>1</sup>, Emilia Ramadhani<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Sumatera Utara, Medan 20222, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup> Pusat Pengajian Komunikasi, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Pulau Pinang 11800, Malaysia

\* Corresponding author: Humaizi, [humaizi@usu.ac.id](mailto:humaizi@usu.ac.id)

## CITATION

Humaizi, Hasan NNN, Dalimunthe MA, Ramadhani E. (2024). Harmony in virtual space: Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) development communication in creating digital literacy based on religious moderation. *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development*. 8(7): 4299. <https://doi.org/10.24294/jipd.v8i7.4299>

## ARTICLE INFO

Received: 24 January 2024

Accepted: 1 March 2024

Available online: 24 July 2024

## COPYRIGHT



Copyright © 2024 by author(s).

*Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development* is published by EnPress Publisher, LLC. This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license.

<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>

**Abstract:** This article aims to analyze the role of the Medan City Religious Harmony Forum (FKUB) in shaping harmony in digital literacy-based virtual communities. FKUB has a central role as an institution that ensures that the aspirations and interests of religious communities can be accommodated effectively. In addition to making real improvements, FKUB also initiated its moderating role through the digital realm. This research adopts a qualitative method using a phenomenological approach. Primary data was obtained through interactions with key informants, while secondary data sources involved articles, books, reportage related to the context of the research theme. Data collection was conducted through interview, observation, and documentation techniques. Data analysis used the Miles and Huberman analysis model with the steps of data coding, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The results showed that FKUB initiated digital literacy-based religious moderation through two development communication models. The first model is a linear model where FKUB acts as a community educator. The second model is a participatory model that is usually uploaded on Instagram, FaceBook and Youtube social media. This model allows the community to comment and have two-way communication with the FKUB. Both models are oriented towards creating collective intelligence as an indicator of building virtual harmony. Through digital literacy-based development communication, FKUB can be a mediator in meeting the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG's), namely: Peace, justice and strong institutions, as well as promoting equality and reducing inequality.

**Keywords:** harmony; development communication; religious moderation; digital literacy

## 1. Introduction

Religious moderation in Indonesia is still a contemporary issue. Reporting the results of the Wahid Institute survey, the intolerance rate in 2021 peaked at 54%, which increased by 8% from the previous year (Media Indonesia, 2022). Even worse, at the level of virtual space, complaints of religious violence have touched more than 3000 cases (Kominfo, 2021). More specifically, in the context of Medan City, this issue is still a challenge in the life of a heterogeneous society.

Based on the latest data, Medan City ranks 88 out of a total of 94 cities in Indonesia, with a score of 4420. This figure reflects a low level of harmony when compared to the highest rank occupied by Singkawang with a score of 6.583 (Setara Institute, 2023). Furthermore, cities in northern Sumatra are experiencing theological chaos (Serambi News, 2023).

Religious heterogeneity in Indonesia today poses challenges and conflicts (Dewi et al., 2023). Differences in beliefs are often a source of discord and tension in society.

Religious conflicts have occurred throughout history, both on a small and large scale, and sometimes even triggered armed conflict. Another challenge that may arise is discrimination and intolerance against religious minorities, which can threaten human rights and religious freedom.

This problem continues to experience continuity along with the development of communication technology. Technology provides opportunities for anyone to massively spread messages including hate speech (Serna, 2023). These hateful messages are often spread quickly and widely, creating an environment that triggers disharmony among religious communities. The power and scope of social media allows toxic messages to reach large numbers of people in a short time, threatening interfaith harmony and cooperation (Valkonen et al., 2023).

The potential for hate speech can lead to segregation in society due to extremism and intolerance (Khan et al., 2023; Khumaini et al., 2023). Especially in the digital era, hate speech exists in massive numbers so that there is often uproar in the virtual space. This challenge is what the Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) is trying to alleviate through digital literacy in accommodating the interests of heterogeneity.

Ideally, as a nation that has embraced the motto “Bhinneka Tunggal Ika” cases of intolerance can be optimally degraded. In Muhtadi (2019) heterogeneity is a necessity for the Indonesian nation. In maintaining the dynamics of heterogeneity, proportional religious moderation is needed. More deeply, the urgency of maintaining social and human values must be an important point in addition to religion (Al-Mujtahid and Sazali, 2023). At this level, a qualified curriculum is needed to eliminate issues of intolerance.

The connection between digital literacy and moderation can be applied in the hope of becoming an antidote to various conflicts (Subchi et al., 2022). By utilizing broad access and reach, FKUB can utilize social media as a campaign instrument for religious moderation amidst the plurality of Medan City.

This research breaks down conventional barriers and shows deep urgency in the context of religious diversity in an increasingly complex digital era. With the inevitable expansion of virtual space, the role of religious harmony forums in digital literacy-based religious moderation is essential to maintain community harmony. This urgency also includes the fulfillment of the Sustainable Development Goal’s (SDGS) in Indonesia to fulfill the nation’s quality of life in the fields of peace, justice and resilient institutions.

## **2. Literature review**

This research uses Participatory Communication Theory as an essential foundation (Dearing, 1995; Dearing and Singhal, 2014). This theory underscores the importance of active involvement of individuals in the communication process, particularly in cyberspace. In the context of religious harmony forums, this theory encourages active community participation in discussions and exchanges of ideas, ensuring that various views and understandings related to religious moderation can be accommodated. Through digital literacy, the forum provides an inclusive and interactive platform, allowing community members to access, evaluate and generate information that supports religious moderation.



contemporaryization, indicators and education. It is quite interesting to the author with the emergence of the theme of digital native and generation. The presence of this theme indicates that religious moderation is a necessity that is continuity. In addition to the above analysis, the author has selected several previous studies to create a relevant research gap.

The first article entitled “Religious Harmony Forum: Ideal Religious Moderation in the Frame of Building Tolerance in Medan City, Indonesia” (2023). The moderating concept that stands out in this research is the concept of development with key opinion leaders. Previous research discussed the role of FKUB in building collective awareness of heterogeneity in Medan City. The previous research and this article have similarities in reviewing the role of FKUB in accommodating the values of religious moderation in Medan City. However, this article specifically discusses the role of FKUB in accommodating collective intelligence in virtual space. The results show that the Religious Harmony Forum of Medan City is working on various programs with three periodizations. This program is implemented through linear communication and participatory communication models.

Then the research entitled “Islamic Communication in Voicing Religious Moderation as an Effort to Prevent Conflicts of Differences in Beliefs” (2023). The model of religious moderation that emerges in this research is conflict resolution-based Islamic communication. The results showed that the main challenge in instilling an attitude of religious moderation with Islamic nuances encourages the importance of Islamic communication to create interaction, giving rise to dialogue and tolerance as a prevention of religious conflict. The difference lies in the context of the discussion where this article specifically discusses religious moderation in the digital space. The results showed that the main challenge in internalizing the values of religious moderation is the drive to create interaction. Then FKUB and religious leaders have a role to accommodate religious harmony and strengthen tolerance.

Furthermore, the research entitled “Challenges of Islamic education in the new era of information and communication technologies” (2023). The model of religious moderation that stands out in this study is the pedagogical model. Previous research discussed cyberculture policies based on educational values. This article discusses digital literacy based on Qur’anic interpretation based on indicators of religious moderation. The results show that religious teaching (Qur’an, Sunnah, and Hadith) is effective as the best source of Islamic education for formulating cultural policies in the virtual space, raising family and individual awareness of threats and opportunities in the virtual space in the face of new phenomena and educational challenges in Islamic society in the era of information and communication.

Finally, the research entitled “Interrupting Voice in Cyber Media: Standing and Rationales of Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) of West Sumatra in Rejecting Religious Moderation Campaign” (2022). The concept emphasized in this research is the guided moderation model with the West Sumatra Ulema Council as the key opinion leader. Previous research shows that through cyberspace, there are also responses, confirmations, and arguments between communication subjects that make the religious discourse discussed remain relevant. The difference with this article is the research subject where this article specifically makes FKUB as the research subject. This article shows that the West Sumatra Ulama Council rejected the government’s

religious moderation campaign, with arguments in cyberspace that kept religious discussion relevant and emphasized cyberspace as a public space for rational evaluation of the campaign.

### **3. Method**

The type of research that the author uses in this article is qualitative research (Creswell, 2020; Yin, 2013). Qualitative research allows researchers to understand the context and complexity of phenomena and provides the flexibility to explore diverse perspectives and allow for unexpected discoveries to emerge during the research process (Creswell and Poth, 2018). According to the aims of this research that analyze the role of the Medan City Religious Harmony Forum (FKUB) in shaping harmony in digital literacy-based virtual communities. The approach used in this research is phenomenology to explore and understand the essence or structure of human experience experienced directly (Van Manen, 2014). The paradigm used in this research is constructivist with a more contextual and in-depth understanding of how individuals shape their understanding of the world (Olsen and Pilson, 2022; Pilarska, 2021).

The research location of this study is at the FKUB Secretariat of Medan City, Jl. Ramlan Yatim No.2, Kotamatum III, Kec. Medan Kota, Medan City, North Sumatra 20212. Primary data sources in this research are key informants, namely: Chairman of FKUB Medan City, Leaders of various religions who are members of FKUB, Digital Communication Experts, Social and Cultural Experts and the People of Medan City. The selection of the three informants was based on the position and authority of the informants in making policies at FKUB. in addition, the three informants also have good knowledge that related to the issue of religious moderation in Indonesia.

The data collection techniques used in this research are observation interviews and documentation. The data collection that collected from the three informants was conducted during the time period of November-December 2023. Unfortunately, the interview technique has the disadvantage of being affected by the subjectivity and bias of both interviewers and respondents (Rubin and Rubin, 2012). The major theme of this question is FKUB's efforts to accommodate religious interests in creating collective intelligence. The main questions were: 1) How are efforts to build religious moderation based on digital literacy? 2) What model does FKUB use in creating collective intelligence related to religious moderation? After the data is collected, the author will analyze the Miles and Huberman version of data with four stages, namely: data collection, data presentation, data reduction and verification and conclusion drawing (Miles et al., 2014; Miles and Huberman, 2016).

### **4. Results and discussion**

#### **4.1. Development communication of FKUB medan city based on digital literacy**

From the results of the author's observations and interviews, it can be understood that the development communication models used are linear and participatory models. These two models are popular methods in the context of development communication.

FKUB Medan City has a crucial role in supporting the achievement of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGS) in Indonesia through digital literacy-based development communication. With social media campaigns, FKUB Medan City makes an active contribution in empowering the community and building a deep understanding of tolerance, religious harmony, and conflict resolution. Through the utilization of social media platforms, FKUB is able to reach a wider audience, promote diversity values, and support interfaith collaboration.

The linear model in the context of development communication describes communication as a one-way flow from a message sender (e.g., government, development agency, or non-governmental organization) to a message receiver (e.g., community, community group). The message is delivered through media or other communication channels, and the message receiver is expected to receive, understand, and follow the directions or instructions given (Servaes, 2020).

This model is implemented by FKUB through media collaboration various open platforms. So far, the most active platforms of FKUB Medan city are Facebook, Website and Youtube. While other platforms are being sought to be active within this year. In addition to disseminating religious moderation content, FKUB also manages its media as a competition platform such as speeches that have been broadcast thousands of times. This is considered successful because the number of viewers exceeds the previously set estimate. FKUB also collaborates with several newspapers in Medan city to spread the message of moderation even more massively.

Through the author’s observations, there are several major themes carried by FKUB Medan City that are linear in digital literacy-based development efforts. Linear content is usually disseminated through the FKUB website. Meanwhile, other social media are two-way communication and participatory. It can be seen in **Table 1**.

**Table 1.** Tabulation of linear communication model.

No	theme	title content
1	Education and Training	FKUB Holds Harmony Awareness Development throughout Medan City
2	Digital Literacy Awareness Campaign	Year-end reflection (inviting the community to maintain harmony)
3	Dissemination of Positive Information	Information on collaboration, traditional events, annual events, and so on.
4	Collaboration with External Parties	Gathering Visit of FKUB Management of Medan City, Head of Ministry of Religious Affairs, Belawan Police and Mayor of Medan City.
5	Monitoring and Rapid Response	24-hour active call center, email and complaint website
6	Inclusivity-Based Approach	Inaugural, FKUB Medan City successfully held a seminar on Religious Harmony Workshop for Medan City 2023
7	Youth Involvement	Akbar Makrab of Religious Studies Students of UIN North Sumatra, FKUB of Medan City eager to Participate
8	Big Day Commemoration	Commemorating religious holidays that are scheduled nationally

- 1) Literacy Education and Training: FKUBs can organize digital literacy education and training programs for their members and the general public. This includes understanding the use of social media platforms, critical appraisal of online

information, and the ability to filter content that may trigger conflict (Machendrawaty et al., 2022; Mahrus et al., 2020).

- 2) Digital Literacy Awareness Campaigns: Through awareness campaigns, FKUBs can convey messages about the importance of digital literacy in the context of religious harmony. These campaigns can be conducted through social media, webinars and online educational materials (Mahyudin et al., 2022).
- 3) Dissemination of Positive Information: FKUBs can be active in disseminating positive and inspiring information related to religious harmony. This can shape a positive image and provide real examples of how religious communities can live in harmony (Yusuf and Mutiara, 2022).
- 4) Collaboration with External Parties: FKUBs can establish partnerships with external parties, such as educational institutions, the government, and digital literacy organizations. These collaborations can expand their reach and provide additional resources to build digital literacy (Bachrong and Karim, 2022; Waston and Suwartini, 2022).
- 5) Monitoring and Rapid Response: Establish an online monitoring team that focuses on content that has the potential to trigger religious conflict. This team can provide a quick response to harmful content and work with social media platforms to address violations (Novebri and Pratiwi, 2021).
- 6) Inclusivity-based Approach: FKUBs can encourage an inclusive approach to digital literacy, teaching their members to respect different religions and views. This includes opening space for discussion and listening to diverse perspectives (Amirullah and Islamy, 2022; Sumpena and Jamaludin, 2020).
- 7) Youth engagement: Getting youth involved in digital literacy and religious moderation initiatives can create significant positive impact. They can be powerful agents of change in building harmony in virtual spaces (Badi'Rohmawati and Izza, 2022; Saputra et al., 2022).
- 8) Big Day Commemoration: FKUBs can utilize virtual space to celebrate and commemorate religious holidays together. Organizing online events, such as webinars, virtual concerts, or thematic discussions, can strengthen the sense of interfaith solidarity and celebrate religious diversity in a positive way. It is important to ensure that commemorations of religious holidays are delivered with respect and do not demean other religions, thus supporting religious moderation efforts in cyberspace (Najib et al., 2022).

From the interviews with Informant 1 and Informant 3, they suggested that this linear model allows for two-way communication so that there is a reciprocal relationship between FKUB as communicator and the community as communicant.

*“In improving digital literacy, we do use social media as a forum for religious moderation campaigns. The use of media aims to receive input or suggestions from the community.”* (Informant 3)

*“We also make many collaborations that are exhibited to the public as a form of digital campaign. There are also competitions on YouTube to attract public interest. We also often conduct monitoring at several points that have been determined and then distributed. This is to lure untapped parties to open the door for further collaboration.”* (Informant 1)

The second model is the participatory communication model. In development communication, it emphasizes the importance of community participation in the communication and development process. This model recognizes that communities have valuable knowledge and experience and that their participation in the planning, implementation, and evaluation of development projects is key to success. Communication in this model takes place in two directions, where communities are invited to actively participate in formulating problems, constructing solutions, and obtaining relevant information (Crowley and Heyer, 2015).

*“We also use a participatory model to invite public interest in religious moderation. Some content is also wrapped with a Call to Act to provoke the community.”* (Informant 1)

The following are some digital literacy-based participatory communication contents that can be carried out by FKUB Medan City can be seen in **Table 2**:

**Table 2.** Digital literacy-based participatory communication model.

No	Content themes	Description
1	Webinars and Online Discussions	FKUBs can organize webinars and online discussions on topics relevant to religious diversity. These webinars could include understanding different religions, interfaith dialog, and understanding contemporary issues related to religious harmony (Taopan et al., 2020).
2	Podcasts or Audio Lectures	FKUBs can create audio content, such as podcasts or recording-based lectures, that contain religious insights, success stories of interfaith collaboration, and an in-depth understanding of diversity values. This format allows audiences to listen to the material more flexibly (Arifinsyah & Damanik, 2020).
3	Educational Infographics and Posters	Using visual media such as infographics and educational posters can help convey information quickly and easily. FKUBs can create visual content that illustrates the principles of tolerance, respect for differences, and the importance of interfaith cooperation (Wikanda et al., 2020).
4	Social Media Campaign	Leverage FKUBs’ presence on social media platforms to spread positive messages and support religious harmony campaigns. Content that can be shared includes inspirational quotes, diversity success stories, and information related to events or activities that support the goal of religious harmony (Prihatiningtyas et al., 2021).
5	Collaboration with Influential People	UBs can work with influential figures or religious leaders who have influence on social media. Through this collaboration, the message of diversity can be more widely spread and reach more people (Abas & Ghofur, 2023).

In the context of using the participatory communication model, areas that can be utilized by the Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) include the development and implementation of communication strategies that support interactive dialogue and active participation from various community groups. These areas include the use of webinars and online discussions to facilitate interfaith discussions, the production of podcasts or audio lectures that provide educational and inspirational material on a flexible basis, and the use of educational infographics and posters as tools to convey important information about tolerance and interfaith cooperation in an engaging and



easy-to-understand manner. This approach aims to create spaces for individuals and groups to contribute, discuss and interact, strengthening understanding and appreciation of religious and cultural diversity.

*“from the five participatory models, we have done all of them, although there are some points that have not been maximized. The evaluation that we noted will boost collaboration with influencers because so far it is still with officials and religious leaders only. We will try to attract several influencer clusters such as young people, entrepreneurs, mothers and several other clusters.”* (Informant 2)

Furthermore, social media campaigns and collaboration with influential figures are other important areas in the participatory communication model. By utilizing social media, FKUB can spread positive messages and support religious harmony campaigns, reach a wider audience and trigger community participation in social dialogue (Rahman, 2021). Collaboration with influential figures on social media also strengthens the spread of diversity messages, leveraging their credibility and reach to inspire wider engagement and discussion. These two areas underscore the importance of digital and social media as participatory communication tools, encouraging the exchange of ideas and building collective awareness of the values of diversity and tolerance in society (Rubino et al., 2023).

The efforts made in the linear and participatory communication model by FKUB have a very important urgency in suppressing religious conflict in the community. First of all, through education and training approaches (Dalimunthe et al., 2023; Indainanto et al., 2023), FKUBs can increase their members' understanding of the values of religious tolerance, harmony and moderation. With this increased awareness, community members are better able to appreciate the diversity of beliefs and avoid conflicts triggered by misunderstanding or prejudice.

Furthermore, digital literacy campaigns and the dissemination of positive information through various media are important because the digital space is often a breeding ground for provocative or harmful narratives, which can trigger religious conflict (Hefni, 2020). By providing education on how to sort and evaluate information wisely, communities can be better able to respond to sensitive content in a constructive and conflict-free manner (Sikumbang et al., 2024).

The importance of youth involvement in this effort cannot be overlooked. Youth play a key role in shaping the future of society, and involving them in education and advocacy activities for interfaith harmony can help shape inclusive and tolerant attitudes from an early age. In addition, collaboration with external parties and influential figures can expand the reach and impact of such efforts, and reinforce messages of peace and unity in society as a whole.

With digital literacy training and educational content, FKUB also seeks to improve the understanding of religious and community leaders regarding the wise use of technology. This initiative directly supports the Indonesian government's efforts in achieving SDGS, especially in creating an inclusive, just and peaceful society. Through digital literacy-based development communication, FKUB Medan City becomes a positive agent in shaping change towards a sustainable society.

## **4.2. Collective intelligence as an indicator of virtual harmony building**

In this era of globalization, virtual harmony is a crucial aspect in building community interactions online (Siregar, 2022). Collective intelligence, as a form of intelligence that emerges from the collaboration of individuals, has a central role in ensuring the sustainable development of virtual harmony. Moreover, when we relate it to religious moderation, collective intelligence becomes an essential foundation for preventing conflict and enhancing understanding across beliefs.

In virtual spaces, diverse religious understandings and beliefs intersect without geographical boundaries. Collective intelligence enables society to effectively navigate these differences. Diversity of views is not only recognized, but also valued as a potential for creating deeper understanding. Religious moderation is key in maintaining a healthy dialog among members of a virtual society, and collective intelligence is a key tool that supports this understanding (Azisi et al., 2023).

In the context of building virtual harmony related to religious moderation, collective intelligence serves as a key indicator that describes the ability of a community to utilize the intelligence of the individuals involved to create a harmonious and inclusive online environment. There are several indicators that can serve as benchmarks in measuring the successful application of collective intelligence in this context.

The ability to maintain a healthy dialog is an important indicator of collective intelligence (Paulson, 2023). Communities that are able to maintain an open and meaningful dialog between members, including by appreciating a diversity of views, demonstrate an understanding of the importance of listening to and understanding different perspectives.

Then, the ability to be wise in assessing information circulating in virtual spaces is also an indicator of collective intelligence. Communities that are able to critically evaluate the information they receive, especially those related to religious issues, are more likely to avoid disseminating information that could trigger interfaith tensions (Woolley et al., 2015).

Furthermore, the ability to collaborate in resolving conflicts is also an important indicator. Communities that can effectively work together to find solutions to conflicts that arise, without compromising the values of diversity, demonstrate a high level of collective intelligence in managing differences in views.

In addition, the development of empathy and tolerance skills is also an important indicator of collective intelligence. The ability to understand and appreciate the views of others, especially in a religious context, is a hallmark of mature collective intelligence and can reduce the risk of conflict due to incomprehension.

However, it should be noted that the application of collective intelligence has its limits. For example, not all communities or individuals may have the same level of collective intelligence, and this may affect their ability to create virtual harmony. In addition, technical constraints, such as access to technology and digital literacy levels, may also limit a community's ability to effectively implement collective intelligence.

In an information-filled virtual world, collective intelligence reflects a shared ability to select and assess circulating information (Calof et al., 2022; Riedl et al., 2021). In the context of religious moderation, people who have high collective

intelligence will be better able to filter content that can trigger inter-religious tensions. Sensitivity to potential provocations and understanding that not all information is objective are key points to achieving sustainable virtual harmony.

Inter-religious conflict in virtual space is not a rare thing. However, collective intelligence brings the ability to collaborate in resolving these conflicts. When virtual communities are able to work together to find solutions without having to sacrifice the values of diversity, virtual harmony can continue to grow. Religious moderation in this case involves a concerted effort to achieve mutual understanding and bridge differences. Collective intelligence also includes the development of empathy and tolerance skills. In the context of religious moderation, understanding other people's points of view is very important. People with high collective intelligence are more likely to be able to put themselves in the shoes of others, thereby reducing the risk of conflict caused by incomprehension.

In the context of building virtual harmony related to religious moderation, collective intelligence serves as a key indicator. Communities that are able to effectively combine the intelligence of their individuals, maintain healthy dialogue, assess information wisely, collaborate in conflict resolution, and develop empathy and tolerance skills, will be able to create a harmonious and inclusive online environment. Investing in the development of collective intelligence is therefore a must to ensure the continuity of virtual harmony within the framework of religious moderation.

#### **4.3. Religious moderation in the context of fulfilling Indonesia's SDGs**

In the digital era that increasingly dominates daily life, the role of religious moderation in the virtual space is crucial in realizing the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in Indonesia. Focusing on the areas of peace, justice and resilient institutions, religious moderation in the digital realm not only offers the potential to address religious conflicts, but also as an instrument to achieve sustainable development goals.

- 1) **Peace in Virtual Space:** Religious moderation in virtual spaces plays a significant role in creating peace and preventing conflicts that can arise due to differences in beliefs. In the SDGs, target number 16 on "Peace, Justice and Strong Institutions" is a top priority. In this context, religious moderation in cyberspace can help ease potential tensions through open dialog, facilitating constructive discussions, and promoting the values of unity and tolerance (Elvinaro and Syarif, 2022).
- 2) **Justice and Equality in the Digital World:** The field of justice and equality is also highlighted in achieving the SDGs. Religious moderation in virtual spaces plays a role in promoting equal access to information and resources, reducing the digital divide, and promoting the values of justice in the treatment of every individual regardless of religious background. Through this approach, religious moderation helps ensure that religious diversity does not become a source of inequality in cyberspace (Hasfi and Rahardjo, 2019; Rossner et al., 2021).
- 3) **Resilient Institutions in a Digital World:** Strong institutions are fundamental to sustainable development. Religious moderation in virtual spaces contributes to the formation of strong and ethical institutions. By empowering religious institutions to become facilitators of interfaith dialogue and collaboration,

religious moderation creates the foundation for institutions that are able to tackle challenges and realize sustainable development goals (Latief et al., 2021; Suwendi et al., 2023).

- 4) **Interfaith Dialogue and Virtual Collaboration:** Virtual spaces provide a unique opportunity to enhance interfaith dialog and interfaith collaboration. Through online platforms, religious moderation can facilitate virtual meetings, webinars, or online discussions that support understanding and tolerance (Sumpena and Jamaludin, 2020; Taopan et al., 2020). This virtual collaboration is a means to achieve the goals of the SDGs, especially in building shared prosperity and solving complex problems that involve various layers of society.
- 5) **Countering Online Radicalism and Extremism:** Religious moderation in virtual spaces also plays a key role in countering online radicalism and extremism (Husni et al., 2022; Samho, 2022). In pursuit of the goals of peace and justice, religious moderation can identify and counter hate-inducing content, and promote narratives that support harmony and unity among digital communities.
- 6) **Inclusive Digital Education:** Digital education is a vital component in achieving the SDGs, especially in improving education quality and access. Religious moderation can promote inclusive education, including materials that respect diversity of beliefs. This creates an online learning environment that supports interfaith harmony and understanding (Frarera, 2023).
- 7) **Digital Environmental Sustainability and Shared Responsibility:** The sustainability of the digital environment is becoming an increasingly important issue. Religious moderation can promote shared responsibility in the use of virtual spaces, maintaining ethics and morality in online interactions. By shaping digital ethical norms, religious moderation contributes to achieving sustainable development goals that take into account aspects of digital sustainability (Romanelli et al., 2021).

In the context of fulfilling the SDGs in Indonesia, religious moderation in virtual spaces opens up great opportunities to achieve sustainable development goals, particularly in the areas of peace, justice and resilient institutions. Through this approach, religious moderation becomes the main pillar to ensure that religious pluralism in Indonesia becomes a force that advances, not divides (Fauzan et al., 2023). By fostering cooperation and empowering communities online, religious moderation is not only a response to digital challenges, but also a key driver in realizing Indonesia's vision of sustainable development.

## **5. Discussion**

In facing the increasingly complex dynamics of virtual space, the Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) is present as a key agent in building harmony through development communication. The concept of harmony not only includes harmony between religious communities, but also explores the potential of digital literacy as the main tool to achieve religious moderation. Participatory communication theory, which emphasizes the active role of the community in the communication process, is a relevant basis in articulating how FKUBs can become pioneers of harmony in the virtual space (Khassawneh and Elrehail, 2022).

In the context of this research, it is important to understand the difference between media literacy, digital literacy and information literacy. Media literacy relates to an understanding of how mass media, such as television, radio and newspapers, and digital platforms, such as websites and social media, are used to disseminate information and messages. Digital literacy, on the other hand, includes an understanding of digital technologies and the ability to interact with online platforms, including the use of the internet, social media and apps. Information literacy, then, focuses on the ability to assess, access and use information critically and effectively, including the ability to assess the reliability of information sources and use information appropriately in decision-making. In the context of digital literacy-based harmony building examined by this research, the integration of the three types of literacy is key in building a collective understanding of religious moderation and interfaith harmony in the virtual space.

FKUBs, through development communication, stimulate active community participation in virtual spaces to build a deeper understanding of religious harmony. Participatory communication theory states that the community is not only a recipient of messages, but also a party to the construction of the message itself. By actively engaging the community in online dialog and activities, FKUB creates a participatory space that allows the community to contribute to the process of creating digital literacy-based harmony.

One of the crucial aspects of digital literacy-based religious moderation is ensuring that people have sufficient understanding of religious and cultural diversity (Faqih, 2021; Purwandari et al., 2022). FKUBs can use online platforms to disseminate educational content such as webinars, podcasts and infographics that build digital literacy and strengthen understanding of different beliefs. By incorporating participatory communication theory, FKUBs encourage communities to actively engage in this learning process, increasing engagement and collective understanding of religious moderation. The same thing was stated by Sahlan, et al (2022) who argued that people tend to access religious information through social media. This should be of particular concern to FKUB as an institution that accommodates religious interests.

In the context of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), FKUB's approach through digital literacy-based development communication can be linked to several SDGs goals. For example, SDGs target number 16, which emphasizes peace, justice and strong institutions, is directly related to FKUB's efforts in creating harmony in the virtual space. In addition, SDGs target number 4, which underlines quality education, and number 10, which promotes equality and reduces inequality, are supported by FKUB initiatives that focus on digital literacy and understanding diversity (Bappenas, 2023).

FKUB as an agent of development communication in the virtual space integrates participatory communication theory to strengthen the effects of digital literacy-based harmony. In building harmony based on digital literacy, FKUB offers substantial benefits in creating mutual understanding and religious moderation in virtual spaces. Key benefits of this approach include the active involvement of the community in the communication process, which enables individuals not only as recipients of messages but also as contributors in the creation of messages. By actively engaging the community in online dialog and other activities, FKUB creates a participatory space

that facilitates the community's contribution to the process of creating harmony based on digital literacy. This approach is in accordance with the research of Syatar, et al. (2020) who said that increasing public understanding of religious and cultural diversity, strengthening tolerance and peaceful coexistence between communities, and promoting religious moderation through education and dialog.

FKUB's application of participatory communication in building harmony includes the use of online platforms to disseminate educational content such as webinars, podcasts and infographics that build digital literacy and strengthen understanding of different beliefs. This reflects how participatory communication theory can be applied in practice, where communities are invited to engage in the learning process, contribute to content creation, and participate in enriching dialog. This approach not only extends the reach of education but also increases engagement and collective understanding of religious moderation, demonstrating how participatory communication can be an effective tool in responding to the complex dynamics of virtual spaces and promoting the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly in creating inclusive, peaceful and just societies (Syarif, 2021). In the context of the SDGs, these steps respond to the call to create an inclusive, peaceful and just society, and actively involve community participation as a key in the process of achieving sustainable development goals. In this way, FKUB transforms into a driving force for harmony in the virtual space that not only mitigates conflict, but also builds a solid foundation for sustainable and inclusive development (Syarif, 2021).

The novelty of this research is the innovative approach of the Religious Harmony Forum (FKUB) in facing the challenges of harmony in virtual space. With a focus on development communication, this research dissects FKUB's key role in creating religious moderation based on digital literacy. Through the integration of participatory communication theory, this research presents a new paradigm in which the community is not only a recipient of messages, but also a proactive actor in the process of creating a collective understanding of religious harmony. By utilizing online platforms, such as webinars and podcasts, FKUB opens a participatory space that allows the community to contribute to building digital literacy and a deep understanding of diversity.

## **6. Conclusion**

Through the above explanation, the conclusion of this research is that through a development communication strategy, FKUB is able to become the main force in shaping digital literacy-based religious moderation in virtual space. By adopting participatory communication theory, FKUB has succeeded in opening a participatory space that allows the community to be actively involved in building a collective understanding of religious harmony. Digital literacy initiatives and the use of online platforms such as webinars and podcasts prove FKUB's effectiveness in improving people's literacy and understanding of religious diversity. Overall, this research confirms that FKUBs are not only mediators of conflict in cyberspace, but also catalysts in realizing inclusive and peaceful sustainable development goals.

FKUB initiated digital literacy-based religious moderation through two development communication models. The first model is a linear model where FKUB

acts as a community educator. The second model is a participatory model that is usually uploaded on Instagram, FaceBook and Youtube social media. This model allows the community to comment and have two-way communication with the FKUB. Both models are oriented towards creating collective intelligence as an indicator of building virtual harmony. Through digital literacy-based development communication, FKUB can be a mediator in meeting the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG's), such as; Peace, justice and strong institutions, as well as promoting equality and reducing inequality.

While this study emphasizes the important role of FKUBs in advancing digital literacy-based religious moderation in virtual spaces, it should be acknowledged that limitations in this study include a primary focus on the outcomes and effectiveness of FKUBs' development communication strategies without going in-depth into the specific challenges faced during their implementation. In addition, this study also relied on qualitative data and anecdotal evidence, which may limit the generalizability of the findings. Future research could remedy this by incorporating quantitative methods or longitudinal studies for a more robust understanding of FKUBs' long-term impact on digital literacy and religious moderation. In addition, further studies that deepen the intra-group dynamics within FKUBs and involve the perspectives of diverse stakeholders are also needed to enrich our understanding of FKUBs' role in promoting religious harmony and inclusive development in the digital age.

**Author contributions:** Conceptualization, H and MAD; methodology, NNNH; software, MAD; validation, ER and MAD; formal analysis, NNNH; investigation, MAD; data curation, ER; writing—original Draft Preparation, MAD; writing—review and editing, H; visualization, MAD; supervision, ER; project administration, MAD; funding acquisition, H. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

**Funding:** This research was funded by the Equity Project Universitas Sumatera Utara with Contract Number 4291/UN5.1.R/SK/PPM/2023.

**Acknowledgments:** The researchers would like to thank the Research Institute of the Universitas Sumatera Utara for providing grants that allowed this study to be conducted successfully through Equity project 2023.

**Conflict of interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

## References

- Abas, Z. & Ghofur, A. (2023). Maintaining Religious Harmony Through Collaboration Strategies. *Indonesian Journal of Islamic Literature and Muslim Society*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.22515/islimus.v6i2.5209>
- Al-Mujtahid, N. M., & Sazali, H. (2023). Revitalization of Moderation Messages in the Madinah Charter: Religious Development Communication Studies. *AT-TURAS: Jurnal Studi Keislaman*, 10(1), 59–79. <https://doi.org/10.33650/at-turas.v10i1.5301>
- Amirullah, A., & Islamy, A. (2022). The Fiqh Muamalah Ijtima'iyyah Paradigm in Reconciliation of Religious Conflicts in Jayapura-Papua City. *Ijtima' Iyya Journal of Muslim Society Research*, 7(1), 59–72. <https://doi.org/10.24090/ijtima'iyya.v7i1.6775>
- Aranda Serna, F. J. (2023). Legal protection of religious sentiments on the Internet. *VISUAL REVIEW. International Visual Culture Review / Revista Internacional de Cultura Visual*, 13(2), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.37467/revvisual.v10.4557>

- Arifinsyah, A., Andy, S., & Damanik, A. (2020). The Urgency of Religious Moderation in Preventing Radicalism in Indonesia. *Esensia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Ushuluddin*, 21(1), 91–108. <https://doi.org/10.14421/esensia.v21i1.2199>
- Azisi, A. M., Basyir, K., Najihuddin, M., et al. (2023). Recontextualizing Interfaith Dialogue as an Implementation of Religious Moderation in the Modern Era: A Study of the Online-Based Inclusive Movement. *FOKUS Jurnal Kajian Keislaman Dan Kemasyarakatan*, 8(1), 83. <https://doi.org/10.29240/jf.v8i1.7461>
- B.Miles, M., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis - Matthew B. Miles, A. Michael Huberman, Johnny Saldaña* - Google Books. In Sage Publications.
- Bachrong, F., & Karim, Abd. (2022). Assilessureng and Assijigeng: The Concept of Religious Moderation Tomanurunge ri Bacukiki. *Al-Qalam*, 28(1), 78. <https://doi.org/10.31969/alq.v28i1.1031>
- Badi' Rohmawati, U., & Izza, Y. P. (2022). Internalization Of Religious Moderation Values In High School Based On Islamic Boarding Schools. *Edureligia: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 6(1), 66–75. <https://doi.org/10.33650/edureligia.v6i1.3655>
- Bappenas. (2023). *SDGs Knowledge Hub 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (Indonesian)*. Available online: <https://sdgs.bappenas.go.id/> (accessed on 5 January 2024).
- Calof, J., Søylen, K. S., Klavans, R., et al. (2022). Understanding the structure, characteristics, and future of collective intelligence using local and global bibliometric analyses. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 178, 121561. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2022.121561>
- Chen, X., He, Y., Wang, L., et al. (2022). The legitimization process of social enterprises across development stages: Two case studies. *Journal of Business Research*, 148, 203–215. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2022.04.054>
- Dearing, J. W. (1995). *Growing a Japanese Science City*. Routledge. pp. 144–176. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203210581>
- Creswell, J. W. (2020). *Qualitative Research & Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches (Indonesian)*. In: *Mycological Research*.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches (International student edition)*. SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Crowley, D., & Heyer, P. (2015). *Communication in History*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315664538>
- Dalimunthe, M. A., Pallathadka, H., Muda, I., et al. (2023). Challenges of Islamic education in the new era of information and communication technologies. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 79(1). <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8608>
- Dearing, J. W., & Singhal, A. (2014). *Communication of Innovations: A Journey with Ev Rogers*. *Communication of Innovations: A Journey with Ev Rogers*, 15–28. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9788132113775.n1>
- Dewi, H. P., Yusri, M., & Ridani, R. (2023). The Role of Modern Islamic Boarding Schools in Responding to the Challenges of Current Religious Moderation (Indonesian). *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dan Keislaman*, 3(1), 29-34.
- Elvinaro, Q., & Syarif, D. (2022). Millennial Generation and Religious Moderation: Peace Generation's Promotion of Religious Moderation on Social Media (Indonesian). *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Ilmu Politik*, 11(2), 195–218. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jispo.v11i2.14411>
- Faqih, A. (2021). The Role of Forum Kerukunan Umat Beragama (FKUB) for Religious Harmony and the Rights of Freedom of Religion or Belief (Forb). *Religió: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama*, 11(1), 75–93. <https://doi.org/10.15642/religio.v11i1.1662>
- Fauzan, I., Arifin, A., Dalimunthe, M. A., et al. (2023). The configuration of ethnic and religious relations towards the 2024 general election: A case study in Medan, Indonesia. *Multidisciplinary Science Journal*, 6(2), 2024006. <https://doi.org/10.31893/multiscience.2024006>
- Feigenbaum, K. (1995). Case Studies as a Research Method. *Gastroenterology Nursing*, 18(2), 54–56. <https://doi.org/10.1097/00001610-199503000-00004>
- Frarera, A. N. (2023). *Religious Moderation in Ethics of Digital Literacy*. Available online: <https://www.j-las.lemkomindo.org/index.php/BCoPJ-LAS/article/view/648> (accessed on 5 January 2024)
- Hasfi, N., & Rahardjo, T. (2019). The Disabled People Virtual Communities in Social Media from The Perspective of Public Sphere Theory. *Jurnal Komunikasi Ikatan Sarjana Komunikasi Indonesia*, 4(2), 65–76. <https://doi.org/10.25008/jkiski.v4i2.327>
- Hati, L. P., al-Mujtahid, N. M., Kholil, S., et al. (2023). Religious Harmony Forum: Ideal Religious Moderation in the Frame of Building Tolerance in Medan City, Indonesia. *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 104(4). <https://doi.org/10.46222/pharosjot.104.420>
- Hefni, W. (2020). Religious Moderation in Digital Space: A Study of Mainstreaming Religious Moderation in State Islamic Religious Universities (Indonesian). *Jurnal Bimas Islam*, 13(1), 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.37302/jbi.v13i1.182>



- Hsu, C.-W., Anastasopoulos, A., & Kim, H.-S. (2023). Instantaneous Feedback-Based Opportunistic Symbol Length Adaptation for Reliable Communication. *IEEE Transactions on Communications*, 71(7), 3876–3888. <https://doi.org/10.1109/tcomm.2023.3266356>
- Husni, A. B. M., Busari, S. A., & Husni, A. B. M. (2022). Manifestation of Moderation in the Context of Islamic Law: Maqasid Study. *Al Hikmah International Journal of Islamic Studies and Human Sciences*, 5(2), 25–44. Internet Archive. <https://doi.org/10.46722/hkmh.5.2.22b>
- Indainanto, Y. I., Dalimunthe, M. A., Sazali, H., et al. (2023). Islamic Communication in Voicing Religious Moderation as an Effort to Prevent Conflicts of Differences in Beliefs. *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 104(4). <https://doi.org/10.46222/pharosjot.104.415>
- Indonesia Media. (2022). Intolerance-Radicalism Tends to Rise (Indonesian). Available online: <https://mediaindonesia.com/politik-dan-hukum/284269/survei-wahid-institute-intoleransi-radikalisme-cenderung-naik.html> (accessed on 5 January 2024).
- Khan, T., Österman, K., & Björkqvist, K. (2023). Severity and Reasons Behind Religious Intolerance in Pakistan: Perceptions of Sunnis, Shias, Ahmadis, and Christians. *Humanities Today: Proceedings*, 2(1), 73–87. <https://doi.org/10.2478/htpr-2023-0008>
- Khassawneh, O., & Elrehail, H. (2022). The Effect of Participative Leadership Style on Employees' Performance: The Contingent Role of Institutional Theory. *Administrative Sciences*, 12(4), 195. <https://doi.org/10.3390/admsci12040195>
- Khumaini, F., Burhanuddin, H. & Wiranata, R. S. (2023). Religious Moderation Education: Integration of Islamic Epistemology in Addressing Religious Plurality in Indonesia (Indonesian). *SALIHA: Jurnal Pendidikan & Agama Islam*, 6(2), 318–335. <https://doi.org/10.54396/saliha.v6i2.878>
- Kominfo. (2021). Since 2018, Kominfo Handles 3,640 SARA-Based Hate Speech in Digital Spaces (Indonesian). Available online: [https://www.kominfo.go.id/content/detail/34136/siaran-pers-no-143hmkominfo042021-tentang-sejak-2018-kominfo-tangani-3640-ujaran-kebencian-berbasis-sara-di-ruang-digital/0/siaran\\_pers](https://www.kominfo.go.id/content/detail/34136/siaran-pers-no-143hmkominfo042021-tentang-sejak-2018-kominfo-tangani-3640-ujaran-kebencian-berbasis-sara-di-ruang-digital/0/siaran_pers) (accessed on 5 January 2024).
- Latief, S., Sari, Y. A., Yusuf, M., et al. (2021). The Development of Islamic Education and Strengthening of National Education System of Indonesia. *International Journal on Advanced Science, Education, and Religion*, 4(2), 86–99. <https://doi.org/10.33648/ijoaser.v4i2.105>
- Machendrawaty, N., Shodiqin, A., & Effendi, D. I. (2022). Da'wah Education Based on Religious Moderation Training Using Digital Technology at Islamic Boarding Schools in East Bandung. *Ilmu Dakwah: Academic Journal for Homiletic Studies*, 16(1), 109–134. <https://doi.org/10.15575/idajhs.v16i1.18124>
- Mahrus, E., Prasajo, Z. H., & Busro, B. (2020). Messages of Religious Moderation Education in Sambas Islamic Manuscripts. *Madania: Jurnal Kajian Keislaman*, 24(1), 39. <https://doi.org/10.29300/madania.v24i1.3283>
- Mahyudin, Habib, M. A. F., & Sulvinajayanti. (2022). Dinamika Pengarusutamaan Moderasi Beragama Dalam Perkembangan Masyarakat Digital (Indonesian). *Asketik*, 6(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.30762/asketik.v6i1.181>
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook*. SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Muhtadi, A. S. (2019). *Interfaith Communication: Finding Solutions to Religious Conflicts (Indonesian)*. In: Conference Proceeding ICONIMAD; 2019.
- Müller, R., Schischke, D., Graf, B., et al. (2023). How can we avoid information overload and techno-frustration as a virtual team? The effect of shared mental models of information and communication technology on information overload and techno-frustration. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 138, 107438. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2022.107438>
- Najib, K. H., Hidayatullah, A. S., & Widayat, P. A. (2022). Efforts to Build Students' Religious Moderation Attitudes through Problem-Based Islamic Religious Learning (Indonesian). *Tarbawiyah: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 6(2), 107. <https://doi.org/10.32332/tarbawiyah.v6i2.5492>
- Nanda, H. F. (2022). Interrupting Voice in Cyber Media: Standing and Rationales of Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI) of West Sumatera in Rejecting Religious Moderation Campaign. Available online: <https://ejournal.uinsaid.ac.id/index.php/dinika/article/view/6454> (accessed on 5 January 2024)
- Novebri, N., & Pratiwi, R. (2021). The Role of Religious Leaders in Conflict Prevention in Multicultural Communities in the Digital Age (Indonesian). *Khalifa: Journal of Islamic Education*, 5(2), 198. <https://doi.org/10.24036/kjie.v5i2.185>
- Olsen, J., & Pilson, A. (2022). Developing Understandings of Disability through a Constructivist Paradigm: Identifying, Overcoming (and Embedding) Crip-Dissonance. *Scandinavian Journal of Disability Research*, 24(1), 15–28. <https://doi.org/10.16993/sjdr.843>

- Parry, J., Brookfield, K., & Bolton, V. (2020). The long arm of the household: Gendered struggles in combining paid work with social and civil participation over the lifecourse. *Gender, Work & Organization*, 28(1), 361–378. Portico. <https://doi.org/10.1111/gwao.12569>
- Paulson, L. (2023). Concluding dialogue. *The Routledge Handbook of Collective Intelligence for Democracy and Governance*, 501–510. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003215929-51>
- Pilarska, J. (2021). 6 The Constructivist Paradigm and Phenomenological Qualitative Research Design. *Research Paradigm Considerations for Emerging Scholars*, 64–83. <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781845418281-008>
- Prihatiningtyas, S., Solihati, S., & Hakim, L. (2021). Da'wah Patterns in Developing Religious Harmony in Semarang City. *Ilmu Dakwah: Academic Journal for Homiletic Studies*, 15(2), 365–386. <https://doi.org/10.15575/idajhs.v15i2.14321>
- Purwandari, R., Aprilia, N., & Sir, T. A. K. (2022). The Role of the Religious Harmony Forum in Resolving Religious Conflicts (Indonesian). *JIE (Journal of Islamic Education)*, 7(2), 198. <https://doi.org/10.52615/jie.v7i2.261>
- Rahman, W. A. (2021). Communication Strategy of the Religious Harmony Forum in Developing Religious Harmony in Sleman Regency (Indonesian). *El Madani: Jurnal Dakwah Dan Komunikasi Islam*, 2(02), 237–260. <https://doi.org/10.53678/elmadani.v2i02.294>
- Riedl, C., Kim, Y. J., Gupta, P., et al. (2021). Quantifying collective intelligence in human groups. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 118(21). <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2005737118>
- Romanelli, M., Gazzola, P., Grechi, D., et al. (2021). Towards a sustainability-oriented religious tourism. *Systems Research and Behavioral Science*, 38(3), 386–396. Portico. <https://doi.org/10.1002/sres.2791>
- Rossner, M., Tait, D., & McCurdy, M. (2021). Justice reimaged: challenges and opportunities with implementing virtual courts. *Current Issues in Criminal Justice*, 33(1), 94–110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10345329.2020.1859968>
- Rubin, H., & Rubin, I. (2005). *Qualitative Interviewing (2nd ed.): The Art of Hearing Data*. SAGE Publications, Inc. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452226651>
- Rubino, R., Ritonga, A. R., Madya, E. B. & Ritonga, H. J. (2023). The Ethics of the Apostle Da'wah in the Qur'an and its Application in Social Media. *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 104(2).
- Sahlan, F., Kumala Sari, E. D., & Sa'diyah, R. (2022). Digital-Based Literacy Analysis of Religious Moderation: Study on Public Higher Education Students. *Progresiva : Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 11(02), 153–166. <https://doi.org/10.22219/progresiva.v11i02.20906>
- Samho, B. (2022). The Urgency of “Religious Moderation” to Prevent Radicalism in Indonesia (Indonesian). *Sapientia Humana: Jurnal Sosial Humaniora*, 2(01), 90–111. <https://doi.org/10.26593/jsh.v2i01.5688>
- Saputra, I., Syahriyan, M., & Tamarin, R. (2022). Religious Moderation Technology in Digital (Remote Id): Application Technology 5.0 in Efforts to Develop Religious Moderation in Youth Communities (Indonesian). *Lembaran Masyarakat: Jurnal Pengembangan Masyarakat Islam*, 8(1), 161–178. <https://doi.org/10.32678/lbrmasy.v8i1.6318>
- Serambi News. (2023). Questioning Intolerant Cities (Indonesian). Available online: <https://aceh.tribunnews.com/2023/05/11/menyoal-kota-kota-intoleran.%0A> (accessed on 5 January 2024).
- Servaes, J. (editor). (2020). *Handbook of Communication for Development and Social Change*. Springer Singapore. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-2014-3>
- Setara Institute. (2023). Tolerant Cities Index 2022 (Indonesian). Available online: <https://setara-institute.org/indeks-kota-toleran-2022-2/> (accessed on 5 January 2024).
- Sikumbang, A. T., Dalimunthe, M. A., Kholil, S., et al. (2023). Digital Da'wah Indonesia Ulema in the Discourse of Theology. *Pharos Journal of Theology*, 105(1). <https://doi.org/10.46222/pharosjot.1051>
- Siregar, M. (2022). Virtual Sufi Da'wah in Preserving Religious Harmony in North Sumatra. *Jurnal Dakwah Risalah*, 32(2), 130. <https://doi.org/10.24014/jdr.v32i2.13778>
- Subchi, I., Zulkifli, Z., Latifa, R., et al. (2022). Religious Moderation in Indonesian Muslims. *Religions*, 13(5), 451. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13050451>
- Sumpena, D., & Jamaludin, A. N. (2020). Pluralistic Da'wah Model in Maintaining Religious Tolerance in Bekasi. *Ilmu Dakwah: Academic Journal for Homiletic Studies*, 14(2), 187–210. <https://doi.org/10.15575/idajhs.v14i2.10219>
- Suwendi, Shobikah, N., Faisal, M. & Muttaqin, I. (2023). Strengthening Religious Moderation As Effort To Prevent Extremism In Education Institution. *Journal of Namibian Studies : History Politics Culture*, 34, 3810–3824. <https://doi.org/10.59670/jns.v34i.1934>

- Syarif, D. (2021). Overcoming Religious Intolerance: An Offer of Religious Moderation from a Shiite Perspective (Indonesian). *Jurnal Sosiologi Agama*, 15(2), 227. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jsa.2021.152-05>
- Syatar, A., Amiruddin, M. M., & Haq, I. (2020). Religious Moderation Campaign Through Social Media At Multicultural Communities. *The Moderation of Islam, Moslem Communities and Cultural Studies* (sinta 4).
- Taopan, N. F., Ly, P., & Lobo, L. (2020). The Role of Forum for Religious Harmony in Improving the Quality of Life Attitudes Tolerance among Religious Groups in the City of Kupang. *Pamator Journal*, 13(1), 44–49. <https://doi.org/10.21107/pamator.v13i1.6913>
- Valkonen, L., Helske, J., & Karvanen, J. (2022). Estimating the causal effect of timing on the reach of social media posts. *Statistical Methods & Applications*, 32(2), 493–507. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10260-022-00664-z>
- Van Manen, M. (2014). *Phenomenology of Practice: Meaning-Giving Methods in Phenomenological Research and Writing (Developing Qualitative Inquiry)*. In Routledge.
- Waston, & Suwartini, S. (2022). Multicultural and multidisciplinary Islamic religious education and its significance for nurturing religious moderatism. *IJoReSH: Indonesian Journal of Religion, Spirituality, and Humanity*, 1(1), 76–98. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijores.v1i1.76-98>
- Wentzel, K., & Skinner, E. (2022). The Other Half of the Story: The Role of Social Relationships and Social Contexts in the Development of Academic Motivation. *Educational Psychology Review*, 34(4), 1865–1876. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-022-09713-1>
- Wikanda, F., Hatta, M., & Abdullah, A. (2020). FKUB's Communication Strategy in Mantaining Religious Harmony in Medan. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 3(3), 1541–1551. <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v3i3.1083>
- Woolley, A. W., Aggarwal, I., & Malone, T. W. (2015). Collective Intelligence and Group Performance. *Current Directions in Psychological Science*, 24(6), 420–424. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0963721415599543>
- Yusuf, M. Z., & Mutiara, D. (2022). Information Dissemination on Religious Moderation: A Content Analysis of the Ministry of Religious Affairs Website (Indonesian). *Dialog*, 45(1), 127–137. <https://doi.org/10.47655/dialog.v45i1.535>